

Determining compact and traffic constrained zones for urban and regional modeling

Discussant

Debarshi Indra

Questions

- Why maximize compactness of a zone?
 - Are real world regions compact? For example, are cities compact? What other measures could be used?
- “Model zone compactness is considered a primary goal because it implies maximum accessibility of all parts within each zone.”
 - At the same time you limit intra-zonal traffic flows (10% of total flows emanating from a region) during zonation. Are these two objectives mutually consistent?
 - Why not define compactness in terms of travel times instead of distance?

Questions

- Formation of zones depend on existing sub-centers and prevailing traffic flows which will change during model simulation.
 - Should the zonation process be independent of these factors?
- Your seeds for the zones are sub-centers.
 - Sub-centers are of different sizes. How do you account for that? Will larger sub-centers generate smaller zones?